



Comment on the book review of *The Cartwright Papers* in the NZMJ

I was interested in the 30 July 2010 issue of the NZMJ, both as a medical historian for the past three decades and as Professor Bryder's partner for the past 20 years.

I have no problem in declaring my personal interest in this matter, but I think it was unfortunate, to say the least, that the *Journal* commissioned Professor Jenny Connor to review *The Cartwright Papers*. Professor Connor is a departmental colleague of Professor Charlotte Paul and they co-taught the Otago PUBH 721 course in Advanced Epidemiology in 2010. Given Professor's Paul central role in the repeated attacks on Professor Bryder and her contributions to *The Cartwright Papers*, it would have been preferable to seek a reviewer from another sphere.

Professor Connor clearly allies herself with Professor Paul and her co-authors, claiming, with regard to Professor's Bryder's book, that 'The mistakes, misunderstandings and mischief in the scientific material and the failure of process in her research are laid bare.' However she provides not a shred of evidence to support this allegation, stating only that 'The second set of essays comprises three responses to Linda Bryder's book by Professor Barbara Brookes, a medical historian at the University of Otago, Charlotte Paul, and Sandra Coney.' Readers are entitled to expect a more balanced appraisal.

Dr Derek A Dow
Honorary Senior Lecturer
University of Auckland